

24 Cathedral Road / 24 Heol y Gadeirlan Cardiff / Caerdydd

CF11 9LJ

Tel / Ffôn: 029 2032 0500

Fax / Ffacs: 029 2032 0600

Textphone / Ffôn testun: 029 2032 0660 info@audit.wales / post@archwilio.cymru www.audit.wales / www.archwilio.cymru

Mr Chris Moore
Director of Corporate Services
Carmarthenshire County Council
County Hall
Carmarthen
SA31 1JP

Dear Chris

Carmarthenshire County Council 2021-22

Audit enquiries to those charged with governance and management

As you will be aware I am required to conduct my financial audit in accordance with the requirements set out in International Standards on Auditing (ISAs). As part of the requirements of the ISAs I am writing to you to formally seek your documented consideration and understanding on a number of governance areas that impact on my audit of your financial statements. These considerations are relevant to both the Council's management and 'those charged with governance'

I have set out below the areas of governance on which I am seeking your views.

- 1. Management processes in relation to:
 - undertaking an assessment of the risk that the financial statements may be materially misstated due to fraud;
 - identifying and responding to risks of fraud in the organisation;
 - communication to employees of views on business practice and ethical behaviour; and
 - communication to those charged with governance the processes for identifying and responding to fraud.
- 2. Management's awareness of any actual or alleged instances of fraud.
- 3. How management gain assurance that all relevant laws and regulations have been complied with.
- 4. Whether there is any potential litigation or claims that would affect the financial statements.

5. Management processes to identify, authorise, approve, account for and disclose related party transactions and relationships.

The information you provide will inform our understanding of the Council and its business processes and support our work in providing an audit opinion on your 2021-22 financial statements.

I have included your responses for 2020-21 in Appendix 1 and would be grateful if you could update these to reflect your current arrangements. Could you please provide this information on behalf of both management and those charged with governance by 31 August 2022. In the meantime, if you have queries, please contact me on 07789397018

Yours sincerely

Richard Harries Engagement Lead

Appendix A

International Standard for Auditing (UK and Ireland) 240 – The auditor's responsibilities relating to fraud in an audit of financial statements

Background

Under the ISA, the primary responsibility for preventing and detecting fraud rests with both management and 'those charged with governance', which for the Council is the Audit Committee. This includes fraud that could impact on the accuracy of the annual accounts. The ISA requires us, as external auditors, to obtain an understanding of how the Council exercises oversight of management's processes for identifying and responding to the risks of fraud and the internal controls established to mitigate them.

What is 'fraud' in the context of the ISA? The ISA views fraud as either:

- the intentional misappropriation of the Council's assets (cash, property, etc); or
- the intentional manipulation or misstatement of the financial statements.

What are we required to do?

We have to obtain evidence of how management and those charged with governance are discharging their responsibilities if we are to properly discharge our responsibilities under ISA240. We are therefore making requests from both management and the Audit Committee:

Enquiries of management		
Question	2020-21 Response	
What is management's assessment of the risk that the financial statements may be materially misstated due to	It is management's opinion that the risk of material misstatement of the financial	It is management's opinion that the risk of material misstatement of the financial

fraud and what are the principle reasons?

checks and controls that are in place.
The Authority has an adequate and effective control environment in operation. There are clear Governance arrangements with defined Management responsibilities and Committee Structures in place and the control framework is generally sound and operated reasonably consistently. The Authority has an established Constitution, has developed Policies and approved Financial Procedure Rules that provide advice and guidance to all staff and members

statements due to fraud are low due to the

The Authority has an Internal Audit team with responsibility for providing ongoing fraud detection and prevention service covers all areas with the exception of "Benefit Fraud", which is a specialist Unit in the Revenues Unit of the Financial Services Division dealing with all Benefit Fraud. The Authority's Anti Fraud and Anti Corruption Strategy has been updated and was approved by the Audit Committee in October 2020 is available on the Authority's Intranet. The Anti Fraud and Anti Corruption Annual report was received and accepted by the Committee in September 2022. Internal Audit aims to provide a pro-active approach to fraud and staff are mindful of the potential for fraud in relation to all systems under review. All Internal Audit

statements due to fraud are low due to the checks and controls that are in place. The Authority has an adequate and effective control environment in operation. There are clear Governance arrangements with defined Management responsibilities and Committee Structures in place and the control framework is generally sound and operated reasonably consistently. The Authority has an established Constitution, has developed Policies and approved Financial Procedure Rules that provide advice and guidance to all staff and members

The Authority has an Internal Audit team with responsibility for providing ongoing fraud detection and prevention service covers all areas with the exception of "Benefit Fraud", which is a specialist Unit in the Revenues Unit of the Financial Services Division dealing with all Benefit Fraud. The Authority's Anti Fraud and Anti Corruption Strategy has been updated and was approved by Audit Committee in October 2020 and is available on the Authority's Intranet, Internal Audit aims to provide a pro-active approach to fraud and staff are mindful of the potential for fraud in relation to all systems under review. All Internal Audit staff have received Fraud awareness training.

The Authority participates in the "National Fraud Initiative", where data on Payroll,

staff have received Fraud awareness training.

The Authority participates in the "National Fraud Initiative", where data on Payroll, Creditors, Housing Benefit, Pensions, Insurance Claims, Blue Badges and VAT issues are matched nationally to identify potential individual frauds. The exercise reviewing data nationally across Local Authorities and other Public Sector Organisations was completed during 2021/2022.

Undoubtedly one of the most effective methods of preventing or minimising fraud is through ensuring robust systems are in operation, which reduce the opportunity for individuals to defraud the Authority. Internal Audit plan their work using risk assessment principles and taking into account changes in services. The adoption of a three year rolling programme provides assurance of the adequacy of audit coverage and allows the flexibility to deal with changes to systems within the Authority.

During Autumn 2020, Fraud and Cyber Awareness training was provided by Dyfed Powys police for CMT, Executive Board Members and some Revenues & Financial Compliance staff. Internal Audit continues to provide training to a range of staff. Creditors, Housing Benefit, Pensions, Insurance Claims, Blue Badges and VAT issues are matched nationally to identify potential individual frauds. The exercise reviewing data nationally across Local Authorities and other Public Sector Organisations was completed during 2018/2019 and this year's exercise is currently underway.

Undoubtedly one of the most effective methods of preventing or minimising fraud is through ensuring robust systems are in operation, which reduce the opportunity for individuals to defraud the Authority. Internal Audit plan their work using risk assessment principles and taking into account changes in services. The adoption of a three year rolling programme provides assurance of the adequacy of audit coverage and allows the flexibility to deal with changes to systems within the Authority.

During Autumn 2020, Fraud and Cyber Awareness training was provided by Dyfed Powys police for CMT, Executive Board Members and some Revenues & Financial Compliance staff. Internal Audit continues to provide training to a range of staff.

Processes implemented to enable remote working have continued to operate securely and officers have reviewed their

Processes implemented to enable remote effectiveness following an implementation working have continued to operate securely period. and officers have reviewed their We are aware of a small number of either effectiveness following an implementation period. attempted/perpetrated fraud incidents. These are all of values below trivial and We are aware of a small number of either would not lead to misstatement. Further attempted/perpetrated fraud incidents. details can be found in the Anti Fraud and These are all of values below trivial and Anti Corruption Annual report presented to would not lead to misstatement. Further the Governance and Audit Committee on 16 July 2021 details can be found in the Anti Fraud and Anti Corruption Annual report presented to the Governance and Audit Committee on 30 September 2022. 2) How can management assure There are clear Governance arrangements There are clear Governance arrangements the Audit Committee that it with defined Management responsibilities with defined Management responsibilities has not been inappropriately and Committee Structures in place. Risk and Committee Structures in place. Risk influenced by external Management and the Control Framework Management and the Control Framework pressures? are sound and operated consistently. The are sound and operated consistently. The Authority has an established Constitution, Authority has an established Constitution, has developed Policies and approved has developed Policies and approved Financial Procedure Rules that provide Financial Procedure Rules that provide advice and guidance to all staff and advice and guidance to all staff and members. members. In September 2020, the Governance and In September 2020, the Governance and Audit Committee received and approved Audit Committee received and approved updated Contract Procedure Rules and updated Contract Procedure Rules and Financial Procedure Rules. These were Financial Procedure Rules. further amended and approved in September 2022. The committee have received separate fraud and accounts training during the year

	The committee have received separate fraud and accounts training during the year as well as sessions conducted by Audit Wales in previous years too.	as well as sessions conducted by the Wales Audit Office in previous years too.
3) Are management aware of any organisational pressure to meet revenue and capital budgets or other financial constraints?	Following a decade of public sector austerity measures, there remains a constant challenge to set, and subsequently meet, revenue and capital budgets. It is a key requirement of the Section 151 Officer to put forward a balanced budget for approval by County Council. Leading up to his Report to County Council, there is effective consultation with Elected Members, Officers and the public to set priorities and cost the implications of any proposals. Public consultation over the last year was adversely impacted by both COVID-19 restrictions combined with the compressed budget timetable owing to the late WG settlement dates. Elected Members, staff and the public have been kept fully abreast of the developments on the financial position of the Authority throughout the budget setting process, and established reporting systems are in place to ensure that budgets are monitored during the year. Decisions have had to be made in respect of prioritisation of services and the inclusion of budget reductions in order to achieve a	Following a decade of public sector austerity measures, there remains a constant challenge to set, and subsequently meet, revenue and capital budgets. It is a key requirement of the Section 151 Officer to put forward a balanced budget for approval by County Council. Leading up to his Report to County Council, there is effective consultation with Elected Members, Officers and the public to set priorities and cost the implications of any proposals. Public consultation over the last year was adversely impacted by both COVID-19 restrictions combined with the compressed budget timetable owing to the late WG settlement dates. Elected Members, staff and the public have been kept fully abreast of the developments on the financial position of the Authority throughout the budget setting process, and established reporting systems are in place to ensure that budgets are monitored during the year. Decisions have had to be made in respect of prioritisation of services and the inclusion of budget reductions in order to achieve a

balanced budget with an acceptable Council balanced budget with an acceptable Council Tax increase. Tax increase. The COVID-19 hardship additional The COVID-19 hardship additional expenditure and income loss claims process expenditure and income loss claims process set up by WG continued to be available to set up by WG and available to all local authorities has provided a vital financial all local authorities in 2021-22, providing c. £20m of additional support. This mechanism lifeline, with the combined pressure in 2020ceased at the end of the financial year, and 21 far exceeding £30m. Whilst this was mitigated through a £3m contingency mechanism remains in place for the budget allocated in the 2022-23 budget. remainder of the financial year, with a clear message from WG that any pressures from 2022/23 and beyond must be met from within Local Authority Core budgets. 4) What processes are Undoubtedly one of the most effective Undoubtedly one of the most effective employed to identify and methods of preventing or minimising fraud is methods of preventing or minimising fraud is respond to the risks of fraud through ensuring robust systems are in through ensuring robust systems are in more generally and specific operation, which reduce the opportunity for operation, which reduce the opportunity for risks of misstatement in the individuals to defraud the Authority. individuals to defraud the Authority. financial statements? The Authority has an Internal Audit team The Authority has an Internal Audit team with responsibility for providing ongoing with responsibility for providing ongoing fraud detection and prevention service fraud detection and prevention service covers all areas with the exception of covers all areas with the exception of "Benefit Fraud", which is a specialist Unit in "Benefit Fraud", which is a specialist Unit in the Revenues Unit of the Financial Services the Revenues Unit of the Financial Services Division dealing with all Benefit Fraud. Division dealing with all Benefit Fraud. Internal Audit aims to provide a pro-active Internal Audit aims to provide a pro-active approach to fraud and staff are mindful of approach to fraud and staff are mindful of

		the potential for fraud in relation to all systems under review. All Internal Audit staff have received Fraud awareness training.	the potential for fraud in relation to all systems under review. All Internal Audit staff have received Fraud awareness training.
comr of eth stand beha	has management municated expectations hical governance and dards of conduct and aviour to all relevant es, and when?	The Authority's updated Anti Fraud and Anti Corruption Strategy was approved by Audit Committee in October 2020. The Authority has a whistleblowing policy and updated its Code of Conduct for Members and Staff in May 2021. Following County Council elections in May 2022, training was held for all members on Code of Conduct, Ethics, Standards, Legal Duties and Responsibilities. All staff are required to make an annual declaration of personal interests and are reminded of the Officers code of Conduct, In September 2020, the Governance and Audit Committee received and approved updated Contract Procedure Rules and Financial Procedure Rules, which were further updated and approved in September 2022. These updates have been communicated to Officers.	The Authority's updated Anti Fraud and Anti Corruption Strategy was approved by Audit Committee in October 2020. The Authority has a whistleblowing policy and updated its Code of Conduct for Members and Staff in May 2021. All staff are required to make an annual declaration of personal interests and are reminded of the Officers code of Conduct, In September 2020, the Governance and Audit Committee received and approved updated Contract Procedure Rules and Financial Procedure Rules. These updates have been communicated to Officers.
place those	t arrangements are in e to report about fraud to e charged with ernance?	The Annual Report from the designated Head of Audit to Audit Committee provides an opportunity to summarise issues relating	The Annual Report from the designated Head of Audit to Audit Committee provides an opportunity to summarise issues relating

responding to the risks of		Framework for detecting and dealing with	Framework for detecting and dealing with	
	fraud within the Council and	fraud matters within the Council.	fraud matters within the Council.	
	the internal control that	Regular Audit Plan updates to Audit	Regular Audit Plan updates to Audit	
	management has established	Committee, and reports on control issue	Committee, and reports on control issue	
	to mitigate those risks?	identified during audits.	identified during audits.	
2)	Have those charged with	Audit Committee is a public meeting so	Audit Committee is a public meeting so	
	governance knowledge of any	individual cases of "suspected fraud" cannot	individual cases of "suspected fraud" cannot	
	actual, suspected or alleged	be discussed in such a forum. The Chair	be discussed in such a forum. The Chair	
	fraud since 1 April 2021?	and Vice Chair of Audit Committee are	and Vice Chair of Audit Committee are	
		provided with greater detail and day to day	provided with greater detail and day to day	
		access to the Internal Audit Management	access to the Internal Audit Management	
		Team. Details of suspected fraud would be	Team. Details of suspected fraud would be	
		shared "informally" with the Chair and Vice	shared "informally" with the Chair and Vice	
		Chair i.e. outside of the Formal Committee	Chair i.e. outside of the Formal Committee	
		Meeting.	Meeting.	
3)	Have those charged with	All Members and employees have a	All Members and employees have a	
	governance any suspicion	responsibility to report Fraud and Corruption	responsibility to report Fraud and Corruption	
	that fraud may be occurring	when they become aware of it. Under	when they become aware of it. Under	
	within the organisation?	Financial Procedure Rules any suspected	Financial Procedure Rules any suspected	
		case of fraud or corruption by any officer or	case of fraud or corruption by any officer or	
	member must be reported to the Head of		member must be reported to the Head of	
Carmai "Whistle Monitor		Revenues ^ Financial Compliance.	Revenues ^ Financial Compliance.	
		Carmarthenshire County Council has a	Carmarthenshire County Council has a	
		"Whistleblowing policy", managed by the	"Whistleblowing policy", managed by the	
		Monitoring officer. This policy enables	Monitoring officer. This policy enables	
		employees to raise concerns and also	employees to raise concerns and also	
		safeguard their interests in line with the	safeguard their interests in line with the	
		Public Interest Disclosure Act 1998.	Public Interest Disclosure Act 1998.	
		Staff and the public are able to report	Staff and the public are able to report	
		suspected Benefit Fraud including Housing	suspected Benefit Fraud including Housing	
		and Council Tax Benefit fraud through the	and Council Tax Benefit fraud through the	
		dedicated "Fraud Hotline".	dedicated "Fraud Hotline".	

4)	Are those charged with governance satisfied that internal controls, including segregation of duties, exist and work effectively? If 'yes', please provide details. If 'no' what are the risk areas?	Yes Regular Audit Plan updates to Audit Committee, and proposed coverage for coming financial years. Reports on control issue identified during audits.	Yes Regular Audit Plan updates to Audit Committee, and proposed coverage for coming financial years. Reports on control issue identified during audits.
5)	How do you encourage staff to report their concerns about fraud and what concerns about fraud are staff expected to report?	A revised Whistleblowing policy was approved by the Authority's Standards Committee in June 2022. It sets out a working environment where Staff can feel confident to raise any concerns about malpractice within the Council. Malpractice can include fraud, corruption, bribery, dishonesty, financial irregularities, serious maladministration because of deliberate and improper conduct, unethical activities (which may be of a criminal nature) and dangerous acts or omissions which create a risk to health, safety or the environment, criminal offences, or failure to comply with a legal or regulatory obligation. The Whistleblowing Procedure is regularly monitored by a Whistleblowing Group and annual reports regarding whistleblowing are submitted to Standards Committee	An updated Whistleblowing policy was approved by the Authority's Standards Committee in July 2021. It sets out a working environment where Staff can feel confident to raise any concerns about malpractice within the Council. Malpractice can include fraud, corruption, bribery, dishonesty, financial irregularities, serious maladministration because of deliberate and improper conduct, unethical activities (which may be of a criminal nature) and dangerous acts or omissions which create a risk to health, safety or the environment, criminal offences, or failure to comply with a legal or regulatory obligation. The Whistleblowing Procedure is regularly monitored by a Whistleblowing Group and annual reports regarding whistleblowing are
6)	From a fraud and corruption perspective, what are considered by those charged with governance to be high risk posts within the organisation and how are the risks relating to these posts	The Audit Committee rely on both Internal Audit and External Audit to undertake an ongoing comprehensive review of the Authority. Individuals controlling large amounts of money / cash or managing high value or attractive assets will naturally be seen as higher risk albeit controls should be	submitted to Standards Committee The Audit Committee rely on both Internal Audit and External Audit to undertake an ongoing comprehensive review of the Authority. Individuals controlling large amounts of money / cash or managing high value or attractive assets will naturally be seen as higher risk albeit controls should be

	identified, assessed and managed?	more secure to prevent any abuse. The Internal Audit Plan is compiled using a Risk Based Approach which takes in to account issues such as value, nature of transaction, past problems etc	more secure to prevent any abuse. The Internal Audit Plan is compiled using a Risk Based Approach which takes in to account issues such as value, nature of transaction, past problems etc	
7)	7) Are those charged with governance aware of any related party relationships or transactions that could give rise to instances of fraud and how does they mitigate the risks associated with fraud related to related party relationships and transactions? All Related Party Transactions are disclouding the statement of Accounts as confirmed in the letter of representation.			
8)	Are those charged with governance aware of any entries made in the accounting records of the organisation that it believes or suspects are false or intentionally misleading?	No – the Letter of representation confirms that the financial statements are free of material misstatements, including omissions	No – the Letter of representation confirms that the financial statements are free of material misstatements, including omissions	
9)		All Elected Members sit on Full Council and various scrutiny committees and have had the opportunity to participate in virtual members as well. This has kept members abreast of, and consulted upon the financial outlook and budget setting. Public consultation was undertaken as far as was possible during the budget setting and specifically on the budget Savings proposals. In addition the External Voting Member is fully aware of the need to meet	All Elected Members sit on Full Council and various scrutiny committees and have had the opportunity to participate in virtual members as well. This has kept members abreast of, and consulted upon the financial outlook and budget setting. Public consultation was undertaken as far as was possible during the budget setting and specifically on the budget Savings proposals. In addition the External Voting Member is fully aware of the need to meet	

revenue and capital budgets or other	revenue and capital budgets or other
constraints.	constraints.

International Standard for Auditing (UK and Ireland) 250 – Consideration of laws and regulations in an audit of financial statements

Background

Under the ISA, in the UK and Ireland, the primary responsibility for ensuring that the entity's operations are conducted in accordance with laws and regulations and the responsibility for the prevention and detection of non compliance rests with management and 'those charged with governance', which for the Council is the Audit Committee. The ISA requires us, as external auditors, to obtain an understanding of how the Committee gains assurance that all relevant laws and regulations have been complied with.

What are we required to do?

We have to obtain evidence of how management and those charged with governance are discharging their responsibilities, if we are to properly discharge our responsibilities under ISA 250. We are therefore making requests from both management and the Audit Committee:

Enquiries of management			
Question	2021-22 Response	2020-21 Response	
1) How have you gained assurance that all relevant laws and regulations have been complied with? Code of Practice on Local Authority Accounting 2020/21, LAAP Bulletins reviewed, CIPFA/IPF training Courses. Audit Wales findings, Wales Chief Accountants Working Group, Specialist advice from Treasury Management Advisors. Technical Working group guidance on COVID19 Agency/Principal grant treatment.		Code of Practice on Local Authority Accounting 2020/21, LAAP Bulletins reviewed, CIPFA/IPF training Courses. Audit Wales findings, Wales Chief Accountants Working Group, Specialist advice from Treasury Management Advisors. Technical Working group guidance on COVID19 Agency/Principal grant treatment.	
Are there any potential litigations or claims that would	Yes – a small number of employment tribunal cases as included in the Contingent	Yes – a small number of employment tribunal cases as included in the Contingent	

affect the financial statements?	liability note included in the statement of accounts	liability note included in the statement of accounts
Enquiries of those charged with		
Question	2021-22 Response	2020-21 Response
Have those charged with governance, exercise oversight of management's processes to ensure that all relevant laws and regulations have been complied with?	Reliance on Internal Audit, Monitoring Officer, Section 151 Officer, Letter of representation and Audit Wales feedback	Reliance on Internal Audit, Monitoring Officer, Section 151 Officer, Letter of representation and Audit Wales feedback
2) Are those charged with governance aware of any non-compliance with relevant laws and regulations?	No	No
3) If there have been instances of non-compliance what are they, and what oversight have those charged with governance had to ensure that action taken by management to address and gaps in control?	No	No

International Standard for Auditing (UK and Ireland) 550 - Related parties

Background

The nature of related party relationships and transactions may, in some circumstances, give rise to higher risks of material misstatement of the financial statements than transactions with unrelated parties. For example:

- Related parties may operate through an extensive and complex range of relationships and structures, with a corresponding increase in the complexity of related party transactions.
- Information systems may be ineffective at identifying or summarising transactions and outstanding balances between an entity and its related parties.
- Related party transactions may not be conducted under normal market terms and conditions; for example, some related party transactions may be conducted with no exchange of consideration.

As related parties are not independent of each other, many financial reporting frameworks establish specific accounting and disclosure requirements for related party relationships, transactions and balances to enable users of the financial statements to understand their nature and actual or potential effects on the financial statements. An understanding of the entity's related party relationships and transactions is relevant to the auditor's evaluation of whether one or more fraud risk factors are present as required by ISA (UK and Ireland) 240, because fraud may be more easily committed through related parties.

What are we required to do?

Where the applicable financial reporting framework establishes requirements for related parties, the auditor has a responsibility to perform audit procedures to identify, assess and respond to the risks of material misstatement arising from the entity's failure to appropriately account for or disclose related party relationships, transactions or balances in accordance with the requirements of the framework. We are therefore making requests from both management and the Audit Committee:

Enquiries of management		
Question 2021-22 Response		2020-21 Response
What controls are in place to identify, authorise, approve, account for and disclose	Enquires made of relevant officers and members for details of any potential related	Enquires made of relevant officers and members for details of any potential related

related party transac relationships? 2) Confirm that you have disclosed to the au	audit by Aud Confirmation Representat relationships appropriately	ctions. Evidence subjected to dit Wales. In given in the Letter of sion that related party and transactions have been by accounted for and disclosed.	party transactions. Evidence subjected to audit by WAO. Confirmation given in the Letter of Representation that related party relationships and transactions have been appropriately accounted for and disclosed. Confirmation given in the Letter of
identity of the entit related parties and related party relations of you are aware; and appropriately account disclosed such relationships and transactions in account the requirement framework.	y's I all the conships f which d unted for n cordance	ion that related party and transactions have been y accounted for and disclosed	Representation that related party relationships and transactions have been appropriately accounted for and disclosed
Enquiries of those cha	rged with governance		
Question		2021-22 Response	2020-21 Response
How do those charged with governance exercise Disclosure made in Accounts which is		nade in the statement of nich is approved by the Audit Letter of Representations and m WAO.	Disclosure made in the statement of Accounts which is approved by the Audit Committee, Letter of Representations and feedback from WAO.